

### **Tenure and Promotion - Creating Fair and Effective Guidelines**

#### ***Articles 19A, 20A, and 20B***

As a member of UMFA you have significant input into the development of Tenure Guidelines and Promotion Guidelines: the collective agreement mandates Members be elected to an advisory committee that will prepare guidelines for their respective Faculty, School, or College. Members also have the right to vote on the final draft recommended by the committee.

Below is a plain language description of how the process should unfold. While similar to the process for drafting and voting on teaching workload guidelines, there are some important differences.

You'll also find some language that, if included in your guidelines, will give individual Members alone the right to choose whether or not to have research metrics form part of their evaluation.

#### **Developing Your Tenure Guidelines and Promotion Guidelines – two processes**

Each Faculty, School, and College must develop its own Tenure Guidelines and Promotion Guidelines in two separate processes: while all UMFA Members in a unit are affected by promotion guidelines, tenure guidelines only apply to the professor ranks.

Part of the strength of this CA language is that to draft these guidelines not only must Deans and Directors involve Members in an advisory committee, but Deans and Directors must also present these draft documents to Members for approval via a vote. We recommend it be by secret ballot.

#### ***Who's Eligible to Participate?***

Every UMFA Member in your faculty, school, or college who has tenure or is eligible for tenure is to be part of the Tenure Guideline process. This excludes the lecturer and instructor ranks. Associate Deans/Directors who either hold tenure or are eligible for tenure are also to be part of the process. While the Dean/Director can't vote, all UMFA Members and Associate Deans with tenure or eligible for tenure are eligible to vote on draft Guidelines.

In the Promotion Guideline development process, Deans and Directors must hold an election for an advisory committee from all UMFA Members and Associate Deans in each unit, and allow all UMFA Members and Associate Deans to vote on the Guidelines. This includes the professor ranks, instructor ranks, and lecturers.

Deans/Directors are not to vote.

In the Academic Librarians' Promotion Guideline development process, the University Librarian must hold an election for an advisory committee from all UMFA Members in the Libraries and Associate University Librarians, and allow all UMFA Members in Libraries and Associate University Librarians to vote on the proposed draft Guidelines. The University Librarian is on the advisory committee, but cannot vote at meetings of eligible members called for the purpose of voting on final drafts.

## **Tenure Guidelines and Promotion Guidelines – Step by Step**

While the two sets of guidelines have to be developed by separate processes, the same steps must be followed in each. Your Dean, Director, or the University Librarian (in the case of Promotion Guidelines for the Academic Librarians) must do the following:

### *1. Oversee the election of an advisory committee:*

- The Dean/Director has to call a meeting of all eligible Members and Associate Deans/Directors (see above) in your Faculty/School to elect an advisory committee that will prepare the draft Guidelines for the Faculty/School. It's important to note that this is not a meeting of faculty council. This is a special meeting that is to only include the eligible Members and Associate Dean/Directors. Deans/Directors do not get a vote.
  - In the case of the Faculty of Health Sciences, each College will elect two eligible Members to the Faculty Advisory Committee

### *2. Call meetings of the advisory committee:*

- The Dean or Director must hold meetings of the elected advisory committee to prepare (or in the case of existing Guidelines, to revise) Guidelines for your Faculty/School. The Dean or Director will serve as the chair of the committee, or will assign a designate.
- The Dean or Director is to ensure that the criteria and weightings in the new or revised Guidelines are fair and appropriate for all disciplines in your Faculty/School, and are consistent with the CA, University policies, and the law. If not, the draft document must be further considered by the advisory committee.
- When the criteria and weightings in the draft Guidelines are in compliance, a majority of advisory committee members must recommend the draft before it is put to a vote of all eligible members meeting in committee. Committee members' dissenting views of the guidelines must also be presented to eligible members before a vote of all eligible members is held.

### *3. Call a meeting of eligible members to vote on a final draft:*

- Once a draft is in compliance with all applicable rules and a majority of advisory committee members recommend that draft, the Dean/Director must call a meeting of all eligible members for the purpose of voting on the draft.
- If a simple majority votes in favour of adopting the draft Guidelines, they shall be adopted. If a majority is not obtained, the guidelines shall be returned to the advisory committee for revisions. **NOTE:** the Dean/Director/University Librarian cannot cast a vote.

- If a majority of votes is not obtained after two consecutive votes, your Dean/Director will then decide whether to keep the existing tenure or promotion guidelines or to adopt the most recently recommended draft Guidelines. Your Dean/Director must provide written reasons for their decision to all UMFA Members in your Faculty/School. They must also communicate the guidelines to all Faculty Members (or all UMFA Members, in the case of Promotion Guidelines).

It's **important to make sure this process is properly followed** for two reasons: (1) If it isn't followed, you diminish your ability to affect what Guidelines are put in place, and (2) the Central Administration or the Association can challenge and potentially overturn the outcomes produced by an improper process.

## Metrics and Tenure and Promotion

A Joint Committee on Metrics, composed of three UMFA Members and three administrators, has written a report based on literature reviews, consultations with experts, and participating in seminars. Among other things, the report concludes that metrics aren't fit for the evaluation of the work of individual academics.

While the three administrators on the committee refused to add the following language to the collective agreement, including it in your tenure and promotion guidelines will create rights for you and your colleagues in regard to how you're evaluated:

- No tenure/promotion criteria shall require the submission of a research metric, nor shall they include any standard or recommended expectation based on a quantitative measure.
- Research metrics will only be used as part of evaluation and/or assessment when such metrics are personally and voluntarily submitted by the applicant.
- There shall be no penalty or adverse inference to any applicant for the non-submission of research metrics as part of the tenure/promotion application.

In the CA research metrics are defined as “the product of the application of quantitative analysis and statistics used to assess the quality of a body of work (eg: h-index, citation index, bibliometrics).” Any evaluation and/or assessment of a Member's research has to be based on a full review of the quality of their contribution to research, scholarly work, and other creative activity, and research metrics can't be used as a substitute for a more comprehensive assessment of quality and quantity. To ensure that metrics aren't imposed on Members, including the above in your tenure and promotion guidelines is essential.

## Where to look for more details

For the Faculty tenure guideline process, see 19.D.1.5 of the CA (pages 62-65)

For the Faculty promotion guidelines process, see 20.A.1.3 of the CA (pages 71-73)

For Librarians' promotion guidelines processes, see 20.B.1.3 of the CA (pages 77-79)

The screenshot shows the UMFA website header with the logo and navigation menu. The 'MEMBER RESOURCES' link is highlighted with a red circle, and a red arrow points from the 'Where to look for more details' section to it. Below the navigation menu, there are several promotional banners, including one for 'We Make UofM Happen' and another for 'Gender solidarity at the University of Manitoba'.

Questions, concerns, or comments? Contact the UMFA office at 474-8272 or faum@umfa.ca.